Mandates of the Special Rapporteur on extrajudicial, summary or arbitrary executions; the Working Group of Experts on People of African Descent; the Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances; the Special Rapporteur on contemporary forms of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance and the Working Group on discrimination against women and girls

Ref.: AL BRA 7/2022 (Please use this reference in your reply)

20 June 2022

Excellency,

We have the honour to address you in our capacities as Special Rapporteur on extrajudicial, summary or arbitrary executions; Working Group of Experts on People of African Descent; Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances; Special Rapporteur on contemporary forms of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance and Working Group on discrimination against women and girls, pursuant to Human Rights Council resolutions 44/5, 45/24, 45/3, 43/36 and 41/6.

In this connection, we would like to bring to the attention of your Excellency's Government information we have received concerning the alleged killings of 69 individuals and enforced disappearance of three individuals, reportedly by members of law enforcement including in the course of police operations and in custody, in the period from 1999 to 2020. Whilst the reported cases demonstrate the systemic and sustained nature of the excessive and lethal use of force by Brazilian security forces, they do not represent all those affected by such patterns of alleged human rights abuses.

Deaths of individuals in the course of police operations have been the subject of several previous communications, most recently <u>AL BRA 14/2021</u> sent on 13 December 2021 concerning an incident in November 2021. We thank you for the replies submitted on <u>15</u> and <u>21</u> February 2022. We note the repeated commitment of your Excellency's Government to conduct impartial, independent and transparent investigations within the national legal framework and the mechanisms indicated for this purpose, and request further information on the identification of the perpetrators of the alleged crimes.

Three of the individual cases included in annex II were also raised previously with your Excellency's Government:

AL BRA 14/2021 also refers to other previous communications. It notes: In May 2021, we expressed our alarm about the killing of at least 26 people during a police operation in the Jacarezinho neighbourhood of Rio de Janeiro¹ (AL BRA 4/2021). In addition, in 2019 and 2018 we also expressed similar concerns in communications (AL BRA 9/2019) and (AL BRA 10/2018). We thank your Excellency's Government for the response and annexes received on 21 July 2021 to AL BRA 4/2021, the response received to AL BRA 9/2019 on 27 August 2019 and the response received to AL BRA 10/2018 on 6 February 2019. We take note of the information that has been provided by your Government on the measures taken to investigate some of such cases. In particular, we welcome the actions taken by the Public Ministry of the State of Rio de Janeiro to initiate an investigation of the allegations of the events that of May 2021 in Jacarezinho neighbourhood of Rio de Janeiro. We also take note of the preventive measures adopted such as the Strategic Plan for the Federal Intervention on the field of public security, the Legacy Plan and the State Plan for the Promotion of Racial Equality. However, we regret that the responses provided do not have detailed information on the measures taken to ensure the impartiality of such investigations; the result of such investigation and the concrete actions taken to prevent the recurrence of such human rights violations.

- The case of Rafael Medina Paulino was raised in BRA 16/2004. According to our records, no reply was received to that communication.
- The case of Marcus Vinicius da Silva was raised in <u>AL BRA 10/2018</u>. We thank your Excellency's Government <u>for the reply</u> which indicated that the National Secretariat of Public Security (SENASP) sent a letter to the State Secretariat of Public Security of Rio de Janeiro. We would like to request updated information on the status of investigations in this case.
- The case of Carlos Eduardo dos Santos Santo is raised in the first paragraph of the information received in <u>AL BRA 9/2019</u>. We thank your Excellency's Government for <u>the reply</u> to that communication. However, we note that no information was provided in relation to this specific incident.

According to the information received:

The details of 69 individuals, including children, reportedly killed by members of law enforcement agencies are enclosed in Annex II. This includes two cases in 1999, three in 2003, two in 2008, four in 2009, one in 2010, one in 2012, three in 2013, two in 2014, 18 in 2015, five in 2016, five in 2017, eight in 2018, eight in 2019 and seven in 2020.

The deaths occurred in different circumstances.

25 of the cases relate to deaths in raids or operations conducted by police. This includes an incident in the State of Ceará on 11 December 2015 where eight individuals were reportedly killed (cases 2-9), and another in Osasco, State of São Paulo, on 13 August 2015 where another eight individuals were reportedly killed (cases 22-28). Other cases linked to raids or police operations include cases 15, 30, 31, 33, 34, 35, 37, 41, 43, 48, 63 and 71.

Several other individuals were killed in the streets or whilst driving by stray bullets from shots allegedly coming from police vehicles (cases 12, 17, 18, 29, 45, 61, 62, 67, 69 and 70).

Three cases relate to deaths of individuals whilst in the custody of security forces (cases 10, 56 and 64). This includes individuals reportedly killed after being ill-treated and others who were arrested with injuries and died in custody reportedly for lack of adequate medical treatment.

37 of the individuals were killed in the State of Rio de Janeiro, 18 in the State of São Paulo, 9 in the State of Ceará (of which eight were reportedly killed in a single incident), two in the State of Espírito Santo, two in the Federal District, and one in the State of Goiás.

Some of the cases were reportedly not investigated (for example case 37). In other cases, investigations were carried out and then closed (for example cases 17, 59, 63 and 64). In some cases, investigations do not appear to have met international standards, as hearings were reportedly postponed multiple times

(for example cases 10 and 32), investigations have been/are pending for several years with no progress made (for example cases 14, 29, 30, 41 and 56), no one was held responsible (for example cases 11, 12, 31, 33, 35, 36, 37, 42, 43, 44, 45, 50, 56, 59, 63, 65 and 67) or no compensation has been provided to surviving victims and victims' families (for example cases 22-28 and 55). Witnesses reportedly chose not to testify due to fear of reprisals or threats (for example cases 13, 14 and 20).

The information received indicates that the documented police interventions disproportionately affected Afro-Brazilians. While the total number of homicides among Brazilians of African descent increased by 11.5% between 2008 and 2018, a 12.9% decrease was recorded among non-Black Brazilians.² In 2020, Brazilians of African descent accounted for 78.9% of victims of police interventions, despite representing only 56.3% of the total Brazilian population, indicating an overrepresentation of Brazilians of African descent among victims of such interventions and illustrating persistent patterns of racial inequality associated with police lethal action. In the same year, Brazil reached its highest number of deaths due to police interventions since 2013, with 6,416 deaths (an average of 17.6 deaths per day), with military police and civilian police reportedly responsible for 72.7% and 2.8% of cases respectively.³ At least 13 teenage children were reportedly among the 69 individuals killed as a result of the reported police and military interventions.

Additionally, three individuals were reportedly forcibly disappeared. These include:

- (case 19 in Annex II) who was detained by four policemen in Queimados, City of Rio de Janeiro in 2003. The police indicated they took him to the police station to take a statement and then released him.
- Paulo Alexandre Gomes (case 51 in Annex II) who was detained by military police in May 2006 in Itaquera, City of São Paulo.
- Davi Santos Fiuza (case 14 in Annex II) who was detained by military police in the City of Salvador, State of Bahia in 2014. In this case, it is reported that charges for kidnapping were made in 2018 against military police officers, but the case was transferred to the state-level military court.

The three individuals have not been seen or heard from since they were detained by the police and their fate and whereabouts remain unknown.

Recent cases of alleged killings in the Jacarezinho Favela, Rio de Janeiro, which took place on 6 May 2021 during an operation of the Civil Police of the State of Rio de Janeiro, reportedly resulting in 28 deaths and 5 injured individuals, the operation of the military police in Vila Cruzeiro, a favela in Complexo da Penha, Rio de Janeiro, on 24 May 2022, in which 23 individuals were reportedly killed, and the alleged killing of a Brazilian national of

https://www.ipea.gov.br/atlasviolencia/download/24/atlas-da-violencia-2020.

https://forumseguranca.org.br/wp-content/uploads/2021/07/4-as-mortes-decorrentes-de-intervencao-policial-no-brasil-em-2020.pdf.

African descent on 25 May 2022, reportedly by agents of the Federal Highway Police in the municipality of Umbaúba after he was allegedly tortured, demonstrate the persistence of the commission of unlawful killings by members of law enforcement in Brazil.

While we do not wish to prejudge the accuracy of the information received, we wish to express our concern at the alleged killing of 69 individuals including during police operations or in custody and the reported enforced disappearance of three individuals and would like to request information on the steps taken to investigate these events and, in the case of the three forcibly disappeared individuals, to search for those reportedly disappeared and establish their fate and whereabouts. With regard to the reported killings, we are seriously concerned that they appear to have targeted women and minors and that witnesses have reportedly been threatened into not cooperating with investigating authorities.

Should the facts alleged above be confirmed, they would amount to a violation of the right to life and security, as set forth in article 3 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR), and in articles 6 and 9 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), ratified by Brazil on 24 January 1992, and the provisiones enshrined in the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, ratified by Brazil on 1 February 1984. The disproportionate impact of such alleged killings on Afro-Brazilians would also be in direct contravention of articles 2 and 5 of the International Convention on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, which Brazil ratified on 27 March 1968. The above allegations also appear to be in violation of the absolute prohibition of torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment, established in article 5 of UDHR, article 7 of the ICCPR, and article 1 of the Convention against Torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment, ratified by Brazil in 1989. With regard to the alleged enforced disappearances, if confirmed, they amount to violations of articles 6, 7, 9 and 16 of the ICCPR, read alone and in conjunction with article 2(3). Moreover, article 7 of the ICCPR is also violated with regard to the relatives of those forcibly disappeared. Enforced disappearances may equally amount to violations of the 1992 Declaration on the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance and of the Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance (ICPPED), which Brazil ratified on 29 November 2010.

We would like to highlight the importance of conducting investigations into all suspected unlawful killings in line with international standards, particularly the Revised United Nations Manual on the Effective Prevention and Investigation of Extra-Legal, Arbitrary and Summary Executions (the *Minnesota Protocol on the Investigation of a Potentially Unlawful Death (2016))*. We reiterate that we stand ready to support your Excellency's Government efforts in this regard and remain available for any assistance we may be able to provide to the authorities concerned. This could include discussions on the investigative steps necessary to comply with such standards and on technical assistance to improve the capacity of relevant officials to conduct such investigations.

In connection with the above alleged facts and concerns, please refer to the Annex on Reference to international human rights law attached to this letter which cites international human rights instruments and standards relevant to these allegations.

As it is our responsibility, under the mandates provided to us by the Human Rights Council, to seek to clarify all cases brought to our attention, we would be grateful for your observations on the following matters:

- 1. Please provide any additional information and/or comment(s) you may have on the above-mentioned allegations.
- 2. Please provide information on any investigations conducted into the 69 killings contained in Annex II and the extent to which the investigations complied with international standards including the United Nations Principles on the Effective Prevention and Investigation of Extra-Legal, Arbitrary and Summary Executions (1989) and the United Nations Revised Manual for the Effective Investigation of Extra-Legal, Arbitrary and Summary Executions (The Minnesota Protocol on the Investigation of Potentially Unlawful Death (2016).
- 3. Please provide detailed information about the outcomes of the investigations conducted into the 69 killings, including any available data about the remedies, including compensation, provided to victims, as well as any administrative and/or criminal sanctions applied to perpetrators.
- 4. Please provide information on any measures, including precautionary measures, in place to ensure and protect the inviolable right to life and security in the context of any type of police interventions, especially raids. Please also indicate how these safeguards provide special protection for minors.
- 5. Please provide information on measures taken or envisaged to be taken to combat gender-based violence against women and girls and ensure that victims/ survivors have prompt and effective access to remedy.
- 6. Please provide information on the measures taken to prevent the excessive use of force, ill-treatment and abuse of authority by all law enforcement actors against vulnerable populations, in particular minors, to address racial bias, particularly against Afro-Brazilians, amongst law enforcement officials, as well as information on trainings conducted on the use of force and human rights training for law enforcement officials.
- 7. Please provide information on the steps taken to search for and establish the fate and whereabouts of Fábio Eduardo Soares Santos de Souza, Paulo Alexandre Gomes and Davi Santos Fiuza. Please provide also information on the steps taken to investigate the reported crimes, identified those responsible, prosecute and, where appropriate, sanction them, as well as to guarantee that the victims and their families receive adequate redress for the harm suffered.

We would appreciate receiving a response within 60 days. Past this delay, this communication and any response received from your Excellency's Government will be made public via the communications reporting website. They will also subsequently be made available in the usual report to be presented to the Human

Rights Council.

While awaiting a reply, we urge that all necessary interim measures be taken to halt the alleged violations and prevent their re-occurrence and in the event that the investigations support or suggest the allegations to be correct, to ensure the accountability of any person(s) responsible for the alleged violations.

Please accept, Excellency, the assurances of our highest consideration.

Morris Tidball-Binz Special Rapporteur on extrajudicial, summary or arbitrary executions

Catherine Namakula Chair-Rapporteur of the Working Group of Experts on People of African Descent

Luciano Hazan Chair-Rapporteur of the Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances

E. Tendayi Achiume Special Rapporteur on contemporary forms of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance

Melissa Upreti Chair-Rapporteur of the Working Group on discrimination against women and girls

Annex I

Reference to international human rights law

In connection with above alleged facts and concerns, we would like to refer your Excellency's Government to article 3 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights which states that "Everyone has the right to life, liberty and security of person"; and article 6 (1) of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) which provides that "Every human being has the inherent right to life. This right shall be protected by law. No one shall be arbitrarily deprived of his life".

We wish to refer to Human Rights Committee, General Comment 36.

It notes that the right to life is the supreme right from which no derogation is permitted. It is most precious for its own sake as a right that inheres in every human being, but it also constitutes a fundamental right, whose effective protection is the prerequisite for the enjoyment of all other human rights and whose content can be informed and infused by other human rights. We note that the General Comment indicates the obligation of the State to provide specific protection for children. In its paragraph 23, it states that "The duty to protect the right to life requires States parties to take special measures of protection towards persons in situation of vulnerability whose lives have been placed at particular risk because of specific threats or pre-existing patterns of violence", including children. The General Comments makes clear that the right to life must be respected and ensured without distinction of any kind, including race.

Paragraph 1 of article 6 of the Covenant provides that no one shall be arbitrarily deprived of life and that this right shall be protected by law. Accordingly, States parties have a duty to refrain from engaging in conduct resulting in arbitrary deprivation of life; and must also exercise due diligence to protect the lives of individuals against deprivations caused by persons or entities whose conduct is not attributable to the State.

In particular, States parties are expected to take all necessary measures to prevent arbitrary deprivation of life by their law enforcement officials. This includes putting in place appropriate legislation controlling the use of lethal force by law enforcement officials, procedures to ensure that law enforcement actions are adequately planned to minimise risks to human life, mandatory reporting, review and investigation of lethal incidents, and supplying forces responsible for crowd control with effective, less-lethal means and adequate protective equipment in order to obviate their need to resort to lethal force.

All operations of law enforcement officials should comply with relevant international standards, including the Code of Conduct for Law Enforcement Officials and the Basic Principles on the Use of Force and Firearms by Law Enforcement Officials, and law enforcement officials should undergo appropriate training designed to inculcate these standards so as to ensure, in all circumstances, the fullest respect for the right to life. In addition, states hold the duty to ensure strict control, including a clear chain of command over all officials responsible for apprehension, arrest, detention, custody and imprisonment, as well as those officials authorized by law to use force and firearms according to the United Nations Principles on the Effective

Prevention and Investigation of Extra-Legal, Arbitrary and Summary Executions (1989) (para. 2).

States parties also have a heightened duty of care to take any necessary measures to protect the lives of individuals deprived of their liberty by the State, since by arresting, detaining, imprisoning or otherwise depriving individuals of their liberty, States parties assume the responsibility to care for their lives and bodily integrity, and they may not rely on lack of financial resources or other logistical problems to reduce this responsibility. The duty to protect the life of all detained individuals includes providing them with the necessary medical care. Loss of life occurring in custody, in unnatural circumstances, creates a presumption of arbitrary deprivation of life by State authorities, which can only be rebutted on the basis of a proper investigation that establishes the State's compliance with its obligations under article 6.

An important element of the protection afforded to the right to life by the Covenant is the obligation on the States parties, where they know or should have known of potentially unlawful deprivations of life, to investigate and, where appropriate, prosecute the perpetrators of such incidents, including incidents involving allegations of excessive use of force with lethal consequences.⁴ In assessing the potential risk of human rights violations, including the right to life, the Inter-American Court of Human Rights factored in the historical structural discrimination based on the economic status and identity of potential victims, which requires the State to be aware of an heightened exposure of these communities to human rights violations and to implement preventive measures accordingly.⁵ The Inter-American Court also recalled that States must have an adequate legal protection framework in place that is effectively enforced, as well as prevention policies and practices that allow for an efficient response to reported patterns of violations of the right to life.⁶

Investigations and prosecutions of potentially unlawful deprivations of life should be undertaken in accordance with relevant international standards, including the aforementioned Principles on the Effective Prevention and Investigation of Extra-Legal, Arbitrary and Summary Executions and the United Nations Revised Manual for the Effective Investigation of Extra-Legal, Arbitrary and Summary Executions (The Minnesota Protocol on the Investigation of Potentially Unlawful Death (2016), and must be aimed at ensuring that those responsible are brought to justice, at promoting accountability and preventing impunity. Investigations should explore, inter alia, the legal responsibility of superior officials with regard to violations of the right to life committed by their subordinates. They must always be independent, impartial, prompt, thorough, effective, credible and transparent. In the event that a violation is found, full reparation must be provided, including adequate measures of compensation, rehabilitation and satisfaction. States parties are also under an obligation to take steps to prevent the occurrence of similar violations in the future.

In this regard, we emphasize that in cases where existing investigative procedures prove inadequate because of a lack of expertise or impartiality, or because of the apparent existence of a pattern of abuse, and in cases, where there are complaints from the family of the victims about these shortcomings or other serious

European Court of Human Rights, Osman v. United Kingdom, no. 23452/94, Judgment 28 October 2010, para. 116.

Inter-American Court of Human Rights, Case of the Hacienda Brasil Verde Workers v. Brazil, Judgment of 20 October 2016, para. 324.
Inter-American Court of Human Rights, González et al ("Cotton Field") v Mexico, Judgment of November 16, 2009, para. 258.

reasons, States must continue the investigation through an independent commission of inquiry or similar procedure in accordance with the above-mentioned Principles on the Effective Prevention and Investigation of Extra-Legal, Arbitrary and Summary Executions (para. 11).

In light of a number of allegations over multiple years that witnesses to killings have been subjected to threats and acts of intimidation, we recall that it is an indispensable obligation of States that complainants, witnesses, those conducting the investigation, and their families be protected from violence, threats of violence, or any other form of intimidation, and that legal representatives and victims' families have access to any hearing, as well as to any information relevant to the investigation, and are entitled to present further evidence. (Principles on the Effective Prevention and Investigation of Extra-Legal, Arbitrary and Summary Executions, para. 15 and 16).

We wish to bring your attention to article 2 (1) of the ICCPR, which makes clear that State parties should ensure that all provisions of the Covenant, including articles 6 and 7, are upheld without distinction of any kind, including race. Moreover article 2 (3) of the ICCPR makes clear that victims of violations of rights under the Covenant are entitled to access remedy, as determined by competent judicial, administrative or legislative authorities.

We also wish to refer to article 7 of the ICCPR, which prohibits torture and cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment, as well as to article 2 of the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (CAT)⁷ states that: "Each State Party shall take effective legislative, administrative, judicial or other measures to prevent acts of torture in any territory under its jurisdiction. No exceptional circumstances whatsoever (...) may be invoked as a justification of torture (...)".

Article 7 of the CAT also states that: "The State Party (...) shall (...) submit the case [of torture] to its competent authorities for the purpose of prosecution (...)".

Article 12 of the CAT further provides that: "Each State Party shall ensure that its competent authorities proceed to a prompt and impartial investigation, wherever there is reasonable ground to believe that an act of torture has been committed in any territory under its jurisdiction".

Article 14 of the CAT states that:" Each State Party shall ensure (...) that the victim of an act of torture obtains redress and has an enforceable right to fair and adequate compensation, including the means for as full rehabilitation as possible. (...).".

In this context, we would also like to recall that the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) in its General Recommendation N°19 (1992), updated by General Recommendation N°35 (2017), defines gender-based violence against women as impairing or nullifying the enjoyment by women of human rights and fundamental freedoms, and constitutes discrimination within the meaning of article 1 of the Convention on the Elimination of All forms of Discrimination Against Women, whether perpetrated by a State official or a private citizen, in public or private life. The CEDAW Committee considers that parties are under an obligation to act with due diligence to investigate all crimes

⁷ https://www.ohchr.org/en/professionalinterest/pages/cat.aspx

perpetrated against women and girls, to prosecute and punish perpetrators, and to provide effective reparations without delay. In General Recommendations N°35, the Committee clarifies that State parties are responsible for acts or omissions of its organs and agents that constitute gender-based violence against women. This includes the acts or omissions of officials in its executive, legislative and judicial branches. Furthermore, parties are responsible for investigating, prosecuting and applying appropriate legal or disciplinary sanctions, as well as providing reparation, in all cases of gender-based violence against women, including those constituting international crimes, and in cases of failure, negligence or omission on the part of public authorities. Finally, it recommended State parties to ensure effective access for victims to courts and tribunals and that the authorities adequately respond to all cases of gender-based violence against women, including by applying criminal law and, as appropriate, ex officio prosecution to bring alleged perpetrators to trial in a fair, impartial, timely and expeditious manner and imposing adequate penalties.

Likewise, the United Nations Declaration on the Elimination of Violence against Women as well as the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women and the Convention of Belém do Pará establish the obligation of States to guarantee women victims of violence access to justice mechanisms and to fair and effective reparations for the harm they have suffered. The Model Protocol recommends the establishment of a reparations fund for victims of gender-based violence against women, with the aim of creating transformative policies that comprehensively address the economic, social, moral and social dimensions of the harm caused to the victims.

We would like to bring to the attention of her Excellency's Government Article 4 (c & d) of the United Nations Declaration on the Elimination of Violence against Women, which affirms the responsibility of States to exercise due diligence to prevent, investigate and, in accordance with national legislation, punish all acts of violence against women, whether those acts are perpetrated by the State or by private persons. To this end, States should establish, in national legislation, criminal, civil, labor and administrative sanctions to punish and redress the wrongs inflicted on women who are subjected to violence; women should be given access to the mechanisms of justice and, in accordance with the provisions of national legislation, to fair and effective redress for the harm they have suffered; States should also inform women of their rights to seek redress through these mechanisms.

In her report on femicide or gender-related killing of women (A/71/398), the Special Rapporteur on violence against women defined femicide as the killing of women because of their sex or gender. According to the Special Rapporteur, it constitutes the most extreme form of violence against women and the most violent manifestation of discrimination and inequality against women. The gender-based killing of women is not an isolated phenomenon that has arisen suddenly and unexpectedly, but represents the final stage of violence after a prolonged and ignored situation of violence that has progressively intensified.

We would also like to recall that article 2 of the International Convention on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (ICERD) establishes the prohibition on all forms of racial discrimination. Under ICERD, State parties, including Brazil, have committed to pursuing the realization of a domestic and international community free of all forms of racism. Article 2 of ICERD requires that in order to facilitate the substantive realization of racial equality, States parties must ensure that they neither

take part in any act of racial discrimination nor further programs that lead to racial inequality. Furthermore, where racism, racial inequality, or racial discrimination exist, they have an obligation to take effective and immediate action. This obligation to act is absolute. State parties' obligations to prevent racial inequality and racial discrimination require them not only to undertake remedial action, but also preventive action. Obligations to achieve racial equality and ensure non-discrimination extend to all areas of governmental policy and influence, including all law enforcement and security services. States must ensure that racial and ethnic groups enjoy the full scope of their human rights, as encompassed in ICERD article 5 and in each human rights treaty, including the rights to life and freedom from cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment. Article 5 of ICERD obligates States Parties to prohibit and eliminate racial discrimination in all its forms and to guarantee the right of everyone, without distinction as to race, colour, or national or ethnic origin, to equality before the law, notably in the enjoyment of a number of rights. This includes the right to security of person and protection by the State against violence or bodily harm, whether inflicted by government officials or by any individual group or institution.

Moreover, we draw your Excellency's Government's attention to the United Nations Declaration on the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearances, which establishes that no State shall practice, permit or tolerate enforced disappearances. The Declaration also proclaims that each State shall take effective legislative, administrative, judicial or other measures to prevent and terminate acts of enforced disappearance in any territory under its jurisdiction. We further recall that the Declaration sets out the necessary guarantees to be offered by the State. In particular, articles 9, 10, 11 and 12 relate to the rights to a prompt and effective judicial remedy to determine the whereabouts of persons deprived of their liberty; to access of competent national authorities to all places of detention; to be held in an officially recognized place of detention, and to be brought before a judicial authority promptly after detention; to accurate information on the detention of persons and their place of detention being made available to their family, counsel or other persons with a legitimate interest; and to the maintenance in every place of detention of official upto-date registers of all detained persons.

We also refer to the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance (ICPPED), ratified by Brazil in 2010, in particular to articles 2, 4, 12, 17-20, and 24 of the Convention.

Finally. as regards the search for the disappeared person, we would like to draw the attention of Your Excellency's Government, to the Guiding Principles for the Search for Disappeared Persons, issued by the Committee on Enforced Disappearances in 2019.

Annex II

Table of information received regarding 72 cases

N°	NAME OF VICTIM	DATE OF KILLING	LOCATIO N OF KILLING	N° OF POLICE INVESTIGATI ON OR JUDICIAL PROSECUTIO N	JURISDICTI ON OF POLICE INVESTIGAI TON OR JUDICIAL PROSECUTI ON	SUMMARY	CONCLUSION OF INVESTIGATION OR JUDICIAL PROSECUTION
1.	Afonso Maurício Linhares	6/18/2014	Manguinhos – City of Rio de Janeiro – State of Rio de Janeiro	Police Inquiry - 901- 00705 / 2014 Public Prosecutor's Office/ RJ - 201400730875	No information	Afonso was whistling during a football match with his friends when the police arrived and approached the boys in a violent manner. Afonso questioned the reason for the police's arrival. One of the policemen became angry and shot him in the head, in front of many witnesses.	No information.
2.		11/12/2015; Minor at the time of the execution.	Fortaleza, State of Ceará	Cases n. 0074012-18.2015.8.06.00 01; 0055869-	1st Jury of Fortaleza	In the early hours of 12 November 2015, several houses were raided by security services, 11 young people were executed and others were tortured. The attacks lasted about 6 hours and became	Most of the indicted are awaiting trial. In July 2016, the Public Prosecutor's Office
3.		11/12/2015; Minor at the time of the execution.	Fortaleza, State of Ceará	44.2016.8.06.00 01 and 0055856- 45.2016.8.06.00 01		known as the "Curió Slaughter." 17, and 17, were killed while talking on the sidewalk. To honor the victims, two streets in the Jangurussu neighborhood were renamed and 1.	filed a complaint against 45 military and civil police officers - 11 crimes of aggravated homicide; 3 attempts at aggravated homicide; 3 crimes of
4.		11/12/2015; Minor at the	Fortaleza, State of			17, a taxi station worker, was shot and killed during the "Curió Slaughter." He was hit by	physical torture and 1 of psychological

5.	José Gilvan Pinto Barbosa	time of the execution 11/12/2015	City of Fortaleza, State of Ceará	a total of seven shots - one in the head, one in the chest, two in the right flank, one in the left flank and two in the back. Gilvan was talking to a another individual on the sidewalk when a group of eight hooded and armed men came out of two vehicles and shot them both. Gilvan was killed. The other individual survived.	torture. All officers save one were preventively arrested, but released less than a year later. Of these, 32 will be tried before a jury; two will be subject to a common
6.	Pedro Alcântara Barroso Nascimento Filho	11/12/2015	Fortaleza, State of Ceará	Pedro, 18, was arriving at home when he was shot during the "Curió Slaughter," on Rua Lucimar de Oliveira.	trial and will be responsible for malfeasance (not having acted to prevent crime) and 10 agents
7.		11/12/2015; Minor at the time of the execution.	Fortaleza, State of Ceará	17, had no criminal record. He was travelling with a person associated with him by bus. Police boarded the bus and removed from the vehicle. He told the person associated with him to run and the police ordered him to lie down on the ground and started to torture him. Although repeated who he was and where he was from, the policemen shot him five times. Reportedly, was killed on Avenida Professor José Artur de Carvalho, in front of number 1220, a few meters from the 35th Police District.	were not prosecuted (process terminated without resolution of the merits), but are subject to an appeal by the Public Prosecutor's Office.
8.	Jandson Alexandre de Souza	11/12/2015	Fortaleza, State of Ceará	Jandson, 19, was staying in the residence of a person associated with him, when the residence was invaded by several men. Jandson was sitting with a child in his lap. One of the individuals took the child off his lap, while the second individual	

9.	Patrício João Pinho Leite	11/12/2015	City of Fortaleza, State of Ceará			shot Jandson in the chest and a third man shot him in the forehead. Although there were vehicles nearby, no one responded to calls for help. Patrício was sitting on the sidewalk with another individual. Hooded men in bulletproof vests with the Military Police insignia arrived. The men reportedly beat Patrício and the other individual and then executed them.	
10.		01/01/2008; Minor at the time of the execution	Ilha do Governador – City of Rio de Janeiro - State of Rio de Janeiro	Case nº 0083038-87.2009.819.000	4th Criminal Court	17, was reportedly killed while in detention by six agents of Degase - General Department of Socio-Educational Measures whilst in custody. On 31 December 2007, had been detained and accused of participating in a robbery at Ipanema beach. was tortured by the agents and continuously attacked with tables, chairs, broom handles, a plastic bag over his face and other instruments, until he ceased reacting and died. Reportedly there were witnesses to his killing. The official report stated that fell while trying to escape over a 3-meter-high wall. However, several individuals had already tried to escape from the same location and that there had not previously been deaths. His death has reportedly caused serious health and psychological consequences in his family.	On May 30, 2011, the State Public Prosecutor's Office publicly denounced agents and for intentional homicide. Five of them, remain employed at Degase and one,

				works at a school. The
				legal process has been
				slow and the hearings
				have been postponed
				numerous times. Once
				hearings are
				completed, the judge
				will determine whether
				the defendants will be
				tried before the Jury
				Tribunal. On 23
				November 2021, the
				Public Prosecutor's
				Office stated the
				defendants should
				respond to the Jury
				Court. A civil action is
				also pending.
				case was
				referred to the Inter
				American Court of
				Human Rights
				(IACHR). IACHR has
				received the complaint
				and begun
				admissibility
				procedures. In
				November 2021, the
				family were informed

							that the Government of Brazil has 3 months (possibly extendable up to another 4 months) to present its observations.
11.	Bruno Soares de Souza	1/30/2019	City of Duque de Caxias - State of Rio de Janeiro	05901607 (police inquiry) - 2019.00330357 (MP)	12th Prosecutor's Office of Criminal Investigation of the 3rd Central of Investigations (12 ^a Promotoria de Justiça de Investigação Penal da 3 ^a Central de Inquéritos)	Bruno was with several others at the gate of his house. Bruno suffered from severe epilepsy and, according to a medical report, had reduced intellectual capacity. Reportedly, shots were heard leading the group to run. Bruno was hit in the back and injured. Bruno reportedly asked the police not to kill him, prior to being shot again. Reportedly, the police threw Bruno's body into an improvised container and took him to the hospital. The Military Police report claims that there was an exchange of shots at the scene and that Bruno was the hit by a "stray bullet".	No one was held responsible for the killing.
12.	Caio Daniel da Silva Lima	03/09/2016	Manguinhos – City of Rio de Janeiro – State of Rio de Janeiro	Not informed	Not informed	Caio was in a field next to his house with other individuals. Suddenly, they heard four shots, one of which hit Caio, who died as a consequence.	No one was held responsible for the homicide. The Specialized Action Group on Public Security in the Public Prosecutor's Office has been dissolved,

13.		11/22/2017	Rocinha slum – City of Rio de Janeiro – State of Rio de Janeiro	Police Inquiry: 90101856/2017	Public Security Specialized Action Group (GAESP) of Public Prosecutor's Office of Rio de Janeiro	was approached by military police officers whilst on his way home. The policeman told him to run and then shot him. Even though injured, he got close to his house, when the police executed him near a wasteland. Officers involved in the murder claimed that there was an exchange of fire in the community. Witnesses chose not to testify in the investigation due to fear of reprisals and harassment by police. This incident and the killing of other residentssparked a protest.	meaning persons associated with him have been unable to obtain information on the incident. No one was held responsible for the crime. The investigation is ongoing.
14.	Davi Santos Fiuza	10/24/2014	City of Salvador – State of Bahia	0333769- 72.2018.805.000 1	Military Court	Davi was approached by a Military Policeman during an operation and taken to an unknown destination. He has not been seen or heard from since, amounting to an enforced disappearance. The main witness of the case was threatened and is under protection.	7 policemen were indicted; however, the trial has not yet occurred. The hearings are supposed to start in April; however, due to the pandemic, no date has been set.
15.	Dennys Guilherme dos Santos Franco	12/01/2019	Paraisópolis neighborho od – City of São Paulo – State of São Paulo	2348288/2019	DHPP and Internal Affairs	Dennys was at a party known as DZ7 Dance, attended by 5000 people and held in the narrow streets of the Paraisópolis neighborhood. At around 4 a.m., when the crowds were densely packed, the military police surrounded the main streets – an area 100 meters in length and 10 meters wide, with two alleys with exits onto other streets. Six	The trial is ongoing. On 7 June 2020, the civil police began hearings of the 31 military police being investigated.

						vehicles and six motorcycles arrived at one of the corners and four vehicles at the opposite corner. Police then began attacking participants with truncheons, rubber bullets, light and sound grenades and tear gas as well as handcrafted bombs which are not part of the official weapons carried by the military police. Nine young people, including Dennys were knocked unconscious by the crowds trapped by the police and died due to mechanical asphyxia by indirect suffocation The police did not provide first aid, including CPR, which could have saved the victim's lives. The victims were removed from the scene and placed in vehicles while they reported to the police command via radio network that there had been a "trampling." An ambulance was approaching the scene. However the police cancelled the request for an ambulance and took the victims to the hospital in police cars. They were already dead upon their arrival at hospital.	In June 2021, 9 military police were indicted for manslaughter. The case is still under investigation and no criminal suit has so far been brought.
16.	Diego Rodrigues Marttos	01/01/2015	City of Mogi das Cruzes – State of São Paulo	IP No. 15/2015	Homicide Sector of Mogi das Cruzes	Diego, 33, was buying fuel at a gas station along with another individual when a red motorcycle with two riders approached him. One of the men on the motorcycle shot Diego multiple times. The man kept shooting although the Diego had already fallen down. The other individual who had been travelling with Diego managed to escape. Reportedly, several other similar episodes took place in the region and 26 individuals were killed in similar circumstances from 2013 to 2015. It is	Two former police officers are under investigation.

17.	Douglas Martins Rodrigues	10/27/2013	City of São Paulo – State of São Paulo	0004581- 33.2013.9.26.00 30	State Public Ministry	believed Diego's killing could be linked to a death squad reportedly connected to the police that operated in the region. Douglas was shot by a military policeman while he was playing with his mobile phone. The police stepped out of the car and shot Douglas. The policeman claimed that the gun fired accidentally. However, the autopsy findings contradict this version of events based on the trajectory of the bullet.	No one was held responsible for the killing and the inquiry was closed. Witnesses were not heard in the process.
18.	Fabrício dos Santos	01/01/2014	Complex of Chapadão slum – City of Rio de Janeiro – State of Rio de Janeiro	0364677- 36.2015.8.19.00 01	4th Criminal Court / RJ	Fabrício was refueling his motorcycle at a gas station close to his residence when he was shot in the head. The shot came from inside a police vehicle allegedly belonging to the 14th Battalion. A video retrieved from the petrol station cameras shows that the police shot Fabrício without him being armed or resisting.	A jury court is scheduled for 3 October 2022.
19.		06/09/2003	Queimados City of Rio de Janeiro – State of Rio de Janeiro	Police Inquiry 95104 / 55 ^a DP.	55th DP of Queimados	was returning from a party in the city of Queimados, state of Rio de Janeiro with another individual when he was approached by four policemen who were in a Blazer vehicle. and the other individual have not been seen or heard from since. There were witnesses to the police approaching The police later said that they just "gave the boys a hard time," took their statement at the police station and released them. During the search for the two individuals, police threatened a person associated with them.	In 2019, the case, which had been closed, was reopened and is not running by the Belfort Roxo Police Station.

20.	Felipe Santos Miranda	03/17/2020	City of Tiradentes – Estate of São Paulo	Not informed	Not informed	Felipe, 18, was sitting on the sidewalk with two other individuals when two men on a black Honda GC 300 motorcycle arrived and asked them to hand over their belongings and then shot them before the individuals could hand over anything. It is believed that the killing was linked to the security services. Reportedly, a military police officer threatened the only witness who subsequently left the neighborhood. Two other young men, Igor Bernardo dos Santos (case 21) and Paulo Gabriel dos Santos (case 52) were killed in the same way.	The Police are still investigating the case.
21.		03/18/2020; Minor at the time of the execution.	City of Tiradentes – State of São Paulo	Not informed	DHPP / SP and Ombudsman	17, was shot five times by a man on a black Honda GC 300motorbike. The man on the motorbike reportedly pretended to want to rob and then shot him. It is believed that the killing was linked to the security services. Two other young men were reportedly killed in the same way. The police alleged that perpetrator of a crime, which is disputed by persons associated with him. The alleged victim of the crime the police accused of participating in, the motorbike and the gun were never found.	Crime investigators are still in the initial stages of investigation.
22.	Fernando Luiz de Paula	08/13/2015	City of Osasco – State of São Paulo	Inquiry 997/2015	DHPP - Homicide and Personal Protection Department / SP	On the night of 13 August 2015, three groups of armed individuals, wearing hoods, started shooting residents of two municipalities, in different locations, including an ice cream parlor and a bar. The attack became known as the "Osasco Slaughter," in the cities of Osasco and Barueri, which resulted in 23 deaths. The victims were between 16 and 41 years old and there was no	Three military police officers and a member of the city guard were put on trial and sentenced. Two of them appealed and had their sentences quashed on 24 July 2019. The

				connection between them. The weapons used were the same used by the security forces. The episode happened days after two robberies followed by the killing of a city guard and a military policeman. Fernando, 34, was shot in the forehead while he was in a bar close to his home as a group of police officers arrived on the site and started shooting indiscriminately.	sentences for the other two convicted defendants were upheld. No compensation was given to the surviving victims and relatives of the victims.
23.	Jailton Vieira da Silva	08/13/2015	City of Osasco – State of São Paulo	Jailton, was killed in a bar along with other individuals as part of the "Osasco Slaughter."	
24.	Leandro Pereira Assunçao	08/13/2015	City of Osasco – State of São Paulo	Leandro was killed in a bar along with other individuals as part of the "Osasco Slaughter."	
25.	Manoel dos Santos	08/13/2015	City of Osasco – State of São Paulo	Manoel dos Santos, 37, was killed in a bar along with other individuals as part of the "Osasco Slaughter."	
26.	Thiago Marcos Damas	08/13/2015	City of Osasco – State of São Paulo	Thiago, 34, was killed in a bar along with other individuals as part of the "Osasco Slaughter."	
27.	Rodrigo Lima da Silva	08/13/2015	City of Osasco – State of São Paulo	Rodrigo was eating an ice cream with another individual in front of a bomboniere in Osasco when suddenly a group of hooded men started firing from a car. His killing was part of the "Osasco Slaughter."	

28.	Wilker Thiago Correia Osório	08/13/2015	City of Osasco – State of São Paulo			Wilker, 29, was coming back from work when he was killed by more than 40 shots fired by police. His death occurred during the "Osasco Slaughter."	
29.	Hugo Leonardo dos Santos Silva	04/17/2012	Rocinha slum – City of Rio de Janeiro – State of Rio de Janeiro	Police Inquiry - 015- 01441 / 2012-01 Process - 0213836- 24.2018.8.19.00 01	Public Security Specialized Action Group (GAESP) of Public Prosecutor's Office of Rio de Janeiro	Hugo Leonardo, 33, was on his way to pick up a young relative from a daycare center when a group of police officers entered a backstreet and started shooting. Hugo was unarmed and was shot in the abdomen. Reportedly, a policeman threatened the residents, then he wrapped Hugo Leonardo body in a sheet and took the body, to a hospital. The policemen claimed that Hugo shot first.	The case was stalled for 5 years. Following protests by the family, the case was sent to the Public Security Specialized Action Group (GAESP) of Public Prosecutor's Office of Rio de Janeiro. On 30 August 2018, a police officer was reported to the Court for the homicide and the complaint was accepted by the judge of the 3rd Criminal Court of the Jury / RJ Court.
30.	Ingrid Mayara Oliveira Lima	01/26/2013	City of Fortaleza – State of Ceará	0037848252013. 80 60001 / 0861239392014	2nd Jury Court/ 4th Public Finance Court	Ingrid was shot in the back by a policeman while she was working as a food vendor. The police were called because noise coming from a party was disturbing the neighborhood. After the police left, the participants of the party turned up the volume of the music again. The policemen returned to the scene. In response to alleged insults	Officers and were dismissed in 2013, but were not held responsible for the killing. The process of the 2nd Jury Court has been stalled since July

31.	02/06/2018; Minor at the time of the execution.	Complex of Maré Slum – City of Rio de Janeiro – State of Rio de Janeiro	0136629- 46.2018.8.19.00 01	5th Public Finance Court	by the policemen, a young man threw the contents of a glass at the policemen, who started firing indiscriminately. Upon hearing the shots, Ingrid started to gather her belongings to escape, when a bullet hit her in the back. Ingrid's body was taken to hospital in a car. Reportedly, an individual was arrested after the shooting. He was told that he would be released if he kept quiet about the shooting. The individual was then released, but was killed a few days later. 13, was shot in the back during a police operation, while he was returning from football training. Reportedly, the Military police spokesman said that an operation had been conducted due to reports that four police officers had been taken hostage. However, the allegedly kidnapped policemen were not found. According to witnesses, after had been shot, police transported his body to the 22nd Military Police Battalion, because they had mistaken him for a suspect. The police indicated that the crime scene was cleared to help the victim. However, the autopsy examination revealed that death was instantaneous.	2019, with no further information from the courts. The civil process of the 4th Public Finance Court has been stalled since March 2019, awaiting the judge's sentence. No one has been held responsible until now. The process is ongoing.
32.	■ U0/3U/ZU16:	Borel slum	Case TJ-RJ	1st Criminal	16, was shot in the head and back while	Military police officer

		time of the execution.	Rio de Janeiro – State of Rio de Janeiro	09.2018.8.19.00 01		associated with him. He reportedly had gone to collect things to bring to a party the next day. The police officer who shot claimed that had pointed a gun at him first. However, the alleged weapon was never produced.	is a defendant. The instruction and trial hearing, was postponed due to the pandemic.
33.		11/06/2018; Minor at the time of the execution.	Complex of Maré Slum – City of Rio de Janeiro – State of Rio de Janeiro	Not informed	Not informed	28, was shot in the chest during a police operation in the Maré complex on 6 November 2018. Jhonson was taken by residents of the complex to a hospital. The doctor indicated that was not in need of surgery and was out of danger. On 7 November 2018, because of a judicial process pending from 2014, Jhonson was immediately taken into custody at the hospital. The policemen were continuously present. On 8 November 2018, persons associated with visited him in hospital. He was unable to speak due to his injuries. Persons associated with him, perceived that he was agitated, but believed this behavior was caused by the pain. On 9 November 2018, persons associated with Jhonson were informed of his death. Reportedly, the doctor was unable to speak freely due to the presence of police officers.	Nobody was held responsible. The State Public Defender's Office is following the investigation.
34.	Josenildo dos Santos	04/02/2009	Morro da Coroa slum – City of Rio de	0169308- 17.2009.8.19.00 01	II Jury Court / RJ	Josenildo dos Santos, was killed by a policeman from the 1st Military Police Battalion, during a raid. He died from several gun shot, mainly to the head and back. Five other people were also killed	The investigation resulted in the conviction of four military police officers

			Janeiro –			during the raid.	as responsible for
			State of Rio				murder of Josenildo
			de Janeiro			The police claimed that they had acted in self-	and the other five
						defense. However, reportedly, there was no	victims. The judge
						confrontation between the police and the local	concluded that the
						traders at the time. Also, according to reports, the	defendants would be
						police removed the bodies from the scene before a	tried by the Jury Court,
						proper investigation could take place.	for the crime of
							"qualified homicide for
							vile reason ". He
							ordered that as a
							precautionary measure
							they should be
							suspended from the
							exercise of public
							service so that they
							would not return to
							work in the community
							where the incident
							occurred, and could not
							possess fire arms, but
							could perform internal
							administrative
							activities. The Jury session was scheduled
							for 8 July 2020, but had to be suspended
							because of the
							pandemic.
35.	Julio Cesar	09/18/2010	Cidade Alta	Inquiry 04814 \	Public Security	Julio Cesar, 21, was assaulted and abducted by	Nobody has been held
33.	Menezes	07/10/2010	Community	2010-38.	Specialized	military police officers from the 16th Military	responsible.
	1410110203	1		2010 50.	Specialized	immany poince officers from the roth winterly	responsione.

36.	Leonardo	11/26/2016	- City of Rio de Janeiro - State of Rio de Janeiro	2019.0033.6702	Action Group (GAESP) of Public Prosecutor's Office of Rio de Janeiro	Police Battalion, during a police operation. Júlio was assisting in organising a children's party when the square was surrounded by state agents, who arrived firing indiscriminately. The residents - including the elderly and children - immediately fled or hid. Júlio attempted to hide under one of the benches in the square, but was found by some policemen who attacked him and put him in an armoured vehicle known as a 'caveirão'. A witness reported that Julius Caesar shouted that he was a resident of the region and begged in vain to call his mother. Persons associated with Julio, were later informed that Julio had been dropped off at a hospital. After waiting for an hour and a half at the hospital, the police finally arrived with the bodies of Júlio and three other young people from the community. The medical assessment revealed that the bodies showed signs of torture and fire-arm injuries. A case was registered at the 38th Civil Police Station/ Rio de Janeiro, but the criminal investigation did not take place until three weeks later. This delay meant proper investigation of the crime scene was not possible. The police alleged that he and the other three individuals were drug dealers and had confronted them. Julius Caesar had no criminal record.	No one was held
30.	de Souza	11/20/2010	Francisco –	-51	Council of	Leonardo was taken to a quarry by 3 police officers. Leonardo was later found unconscious	responsible for the

Lima	City of Afonso Claudio – State of Espírito Santo	Public Prosecutor's Office	after allegedly falling from the top of a 30-metre quarry. Rescue services were slow to arrive. The military police were also called, but took some time to arrive. They did not cordon off the site as per usual practice, and instead allowed people access. Reportedly, the injuries sustained did not correspond to the extent of the alleged fall, including: • There was bilateral pulmonary contusion, evidenced in the cadaveric examination report, incompatible with a fall; • A blunt action was the cause of death; • The degree of traumatic brain injury was not compatible with an alleged fall from a height greater than 10 (ten) meters; • There were no bruises on the face or broken bones, which would have resulted from a fall; • The presence of slime was found along the quarry, but none of this slime was found on Leonardo's body, nails or clothing. Consequently, persons associated with Leonardo requested a better investigation of the incident. However, this request was denied by the presiding police chief (Delegado), since according to his reconstruction it was an accident.	case.
------	--	----------------------------------	---	-------

After persons associated with Leonardo insisted, the Prosecutor's Office asked for further investigations, in which the police did not participate. However, when the investigators discovered that a policeman was suspected of being involved in the victim's death, the deputy hastily closed the investigation without concluding it.
After persons associated with Leonardo insisted, a simulation of the incident was carried out at the scene. Nevertheless, the additional investigations were carried out without due care. Defects in the investigations included that: • The main witnesses who first arrived at the
scene were allegedly not heard, one of whom reported that a blood-stained stone was found in the vicinity of the incident, Another witness indicated they were too afraid to testify. The main suspects were not interviewed. A request for the exhumation of the body
 A request for the exhumation of the body was not granted. A request to receive transcripts of exchanges with the emergency services on the day of the incident was refused. During the reconstruction, the fall test

37.	Lorran de Oliveira Gomes	11/11/2017	Salgueiro Complex Slum – City of ão Gonçalo – State of Rio de Janeiro	Police Inquiry No. 951-01098 / 2017 and MPRJ 201701195734	Military Justice / RJ	dummy used by the civil police was a shop dummy. Moreover, the expert witness did not go to the place of the alleged fall and the fall of the body was not simulated. On the basis of this simulation, the delegate concluded that the incident could have been an accident and the investigation was closed. Lorran was riding a motorcycle with a friend when he was shot eight times, causing his death. Seven more people were killed during the same operation commanded by the Civil Police, with the participation of the Army. According to persons associated with Lorran the investigation was not adequate as the investigators did not perform a ballistics exam on any of the projectiles.	The Military Public Ministry dismissed the case due to lack of evidence. No one was held responsible for the killing. In May 2018, the Public Defender's Office in Rio de Janeiro reported the case to the InterAmerican Commission on Human Rights (IACHR). No information has been received on the progress of the complaint.
38.	Lucas de Azevedo	12/30/2018	Morro da Lagartixa	Police Inquiry No. 253 -	Public Security Specialized	Lucas, 18, left his house a few minutes before 7 a.m. and took a motorcycle taxi to the house of a	An investigation was initiated at the 39th
	Albino		slum	05506/2018	Action Group	person associated with him. As he arrived at the	Police Office (Pavuna)
			City of Rio	Process No.	(GAESP) of	corner between Pastor Martin Luther King and	and was later
			de Janeiro –	Process No.	Public	Estrada de Botafogo streets, a military police	transferred to the

			State of Rio de Janeiro	0015201- 63.2019.8.19.00 01	Prosecutor's Office of Rio de Janeiro	vehicle fired and shot Lucas in his shoulder, causing the motorcycle to fall to the ground. Lucas started shouting for help. The police put him inside	Homicide Division. It was also followed by the Public Security
						a vehicle while he was still alive.	Specialized Action Group (GAESP) of
						Persons associated with Lucas went to the hospital. By the time they were admitted to the hospital,	Public Prosecutor's Office of Rio de
						Lucas was already dead, and had been hit by a	Janeiro, after persons
						second bullet on the head.	associated with Lucas,
							talked to the media
						At the police station, the police officers alleged	regarding his killing
						that they had seen two armed people on a motorcycle, who allegedly shot at the vehicle and	and shared a photo in which he appears to be
						the police officers had "retaliated against the unjust	placed alive in the
						aggression". However, no weapons were seized.	vehicle. People close to
						Moreover, the Police presented a grenade, drugs	him were heard in
						and a radio transmitter at the police station as belonging to the victim, in an attempt to frame	advance by the 4th Criminal Court, but the
						him.	investigation has not
							yet been concluded by
							GAESP. Three of the
							four police officers
							involved in Lucas' death had their
							weapons suspended
							and were removed
							from activities on the
							streets.
39.	Magno	05/31/2009	Novo Gama	IPL (Civil		Magno was returning with two others. The two	A military policeman
	Satiro Alves Gomes		, Goiás state	Police Inquiry)		other individuals had walked a little distance away, when they were approached by military police. The	was accused of being involved in Magno's
	Gomes			11		when they were approached by minuary police. The	involved in Magno's

64/2011/DELE	police ordered the two individuals to put their	death.
GACIA DE	hands on their heads and turn towards a wall.	
POLÍCIA	Magno came closer to rejoin the other two	A post mortem was
CIVIL DE	individuals. One of the police ordered him to put	carried out. However,
NOVO GAMA-	his hands on his head and then shot three times at	it did not indicate the
IPM (Military	Magno who died. Police claimed Magno was	distance from which
Police Inquiry)	armed.	the shots were likely
nº 0065/09 –		fired or whether firing
Ação		residue was found on
Penal(Prosecuti		his hands.
on)/TJGO nº		
2012.0151-8150		The Public ministry
(151815-		repeatedly requested
09.2012.8.09.01		that the Legal Medical
60)		Institute of Luziânia
		conduct an expert
		examination
		report on the firearm
		weapon alleged to be
		Magno's. After several
		requests, the 19 th
		battalion of the
		Military police
		indicated they were not
		in possession of the
		weapon.
		1
		The public
		prosecutor's office
		absolved the accused
		without mentioning the

							defects in the investigation.
40.	Marcio Lucas Gurtler	10/01/1999	City of Vitória – State of Espírito Santo	0016730- 55.1999.8.08.00 24	1st Criminal Court of Vitória	Macio Lucas Gurtler was killed in a bar. Around 8 p.m. two men broke in the bar heavily armed (with illegal weapons) and started firing. The attack resulted in four dead and several injured.	A month before the end of the prescription period of the crime, the State Prosecutor's Office filed a complaint against a Military Police officer. An instruction hearing was scheduled for 5 May 2020, but, due to the pandemic, it was canceled, with no new date set.
41.	Marcos Luciano Mozer de Souza	01/17/2018	Muquiço Slum – City of Rio de Janeiro – State of Rio de Janeiro	Occurrence Record No. 034-01006 / 2018	33rd Police Station (Civil Police of the State of Rio de Janeiro)	Marcos Luciano, 18, was killed during a Military Police operation. The victim had surrendered himself to police, but was killed with two shots in the back. Marcos had worked in the socio-educational system and was involved in the retail of illicit drugs in the favela where he lived. The officers involved in the operation claimed that they had found a pistol clip in Marcos' pocket. However, this clip was intact and Marcos did not have a pistol on him.	The investigations were not concluded.

					A case was registered as "police officer's self-defense" by the police officers who participated in the operation. Marcos was buried as an indigent, even though his family went to the Legal Medical Institute, to perform the body recognition, holding his birth certificate.	
42.	Marcos Paulo Tavares da Cruz	06/03/2019	City of Nilópolis - State of Rio de Janeiro	The homicide police station in Rio de Janeiro investigates the case. The family has no information.		no one has been esponsible for the

						his family.	
43.	Marcus Vinicius da Silva	06/20/2018	Vila do Pinheiro, Complex of Maré Slums – City of Rio de Janeiro – State of Rio de Janeiro	021-06735 / 2018	Homicide Police / RJ	On 20 June 2018, a police intervention was being conducted in the area with intense aerial fire from an armored helicopter. The operation also included armored cars from the civil police and the army. Marcus Vinicius, 14, was shot in the stomach while he was walking to school. He was wearing a backpack on his shoulders and a school uniform. After being shot, he was taken by residents to an emergency medical service. Marcus stated that he had seen the gunshot coming from an armoured vehicle (the 'Caveirão'). Marcus was in urgent need of being transferred to a hospital, but the police denied the ambulance entry to transport him. This action by the police contravened the rules on the presence of ambulances in Maré police operations, the aim of which is to support emergency and urgent cases arising from armed conflicts in the territory. Some time after the clashes, the ambulance managed to enter and transfer Marcus to the Getúlio Vargas hospital. At the hospital, Marcus underwent surgery, but died on the night of 20 June 2018. The following day, on 21 June 2018, the Homicide Division went to the favela Vila do Pinheiro, to investigate the scene where Marcus had been shot. Reportedly, more than 100 bullet marks were	Nobody has been held responsible.

						visible on the ground after the police operation the previous day, demonstrating the risk faced by children and adolescents in the region.	
44.	Mateus Vieira de Jesus	11/09/2017	City of São Paulo – State of São Paulo	0001219_62201 8.8 260052	Civil Police Internal Affairs / SP	On 9 November 2017, a group of agents from the São Paulo Civil Police reportedly went to the local community to extort money from residents. The agents stopped a person associated with Mateus, and threatened to kill him after he refused to hand over any money. Mateus, not knowing that the individuals were policemen, saw the scene and tried to help the person associated with him. One of the policemen shot Mateus in the leg and Mateus fell over. The agent who fired was urged by a colleague to kill Mateus. Subsequently, the officer shot Mateus in the head and he died. Four civil police officers and two citizens who assisted the police participated in the killing.	The Civil Police officer who fired the shot was arrested but later released.
45.	Matheus Djair Cavalcante de Oliveira	11/19/2017	City of Tiradentes – City of São Paulo – State of São Paulo	Not informed	Not informed	Matheus was driving a motorcycle at Viaduto Aricanduva, East Zone of the city of São Paulo when he shot in the head by a Military Police agent, who was reportedly identified as driving in a silver Ford Fiesta. The police officer reportedly recorded and posted a video on Facebook which showed Matheus in pain after he had been shot. Matheus was taken to Tatuapé Hospital. The Hospital was located a few minutes away from the place of the incident. However, there was a gap of an hour from Matheus being taken from the scene and arriving in the hospital.	A civilian was framed and died in prison. The Military Police officer responsible for the killing remains unpunished.

46.	Matheus Melo de Castro	12/03/2018	City of Rio de Janeiro – State of Rio de Janeiro	901.00377 / 2018-1	Not informed	An individual was arrested for the killing of Matheus. He later died in prison. It is alleged that he had been framed for the killing as on the day of the incident he was found wounded at Planalto Hospital in the neighborhood of Itaquera, which is a significant distance away from where Matheus was killed. Persons associated with Matheus requested that the military police in question be investigated and tried. However, the prosecutor in charge indicated that the case would be closed. After leaving the church, Matheus gave a person associated with him a lift to their home, on a motorcycle. At around 9.30 p.m., after dropping the person off, Mateus was shot in the chest by the Military Police just outside the neighborhood, close to a Pacifying Police Unit. He was killed by the shot. Reportedly there were some witnesses at the time of the shooting.	Not informed.
47.	Maxwil de Souza dos Santos	05/24/2009	Cinco Bocas Community slum - City of Rio de Janeiro – State of Rio de Janeiro	Proc.0171508- 60.2010.8.19.00 01.	4th Criminal Court	Maxwil, 21, was driving to a party on the back of a motorcycle with another person when 8 military police officers shot both of them. Surprised by the shots, Maxwill fell off the bike. While he was on the ground he was shot five times by the state agents. The other individual was able to rise away on the motorbike. There were witnesses. The police removed Maxwil's body from the scene and hid a gun and drugs in his pockets. However, it was later found that the gun was very old and	There is a pending judgment by the Jury Tribunal, three of the eight police officers involved in the crime were indicted. The officers claimed that Maxwil had exchanged shots with them. There are two lawsuits: the civil lawsuit

		crime was finalised one month after the execution. Persons associated with Maxwil were alerted by a resident that a few days prior to the reconstruction, police officers had gone to the scene to forge an exchange of gunfire. Reportedly, one witness decided not to cooperate because of fear of retaliation. Reportedly, one witness decided not to cooperate because of fear of retaliation. State was responsible for the murder of Maxwil. Despite this, the criminal proceedings are still ongoing. The first hearing was held three years after the crime, in 2011. In the past year, there were no hearings and one of the defendants died. Persons associated with Maxwill were also intimidated by the defendants after one of the hearings.
48. Maykon 20/02/2019 Planaltina, Federal	IPL(Civil Police Inquiry) no	Maykon was celebrating his birthday at Gas Station called Itiquira, in Planaltina, Distrito A letter from 2020 indicated that the case
Ribeiro District in	222/2019-4/SR/	Federal. The military police were called because of was awaiting various
Lima Brazil.	PF/DF	the noise of the party. Federal highway Patrolmen records and evidence
Diazii.	(Inicialmente	arrived to support the military police. One of the in order to produce the

				apurado pela ocorrência policial [Initially ascertained by police report]) n° 1934/2019-16a DPCivil)		highway policemen shot Maykon who died instantly. Police alleged Maykon had a gun in his hand and disobeyed an order to stop from the federal high way police. A video of the incident appears to dispute this account.	final report to the police investigation for referral to the judiciary.
49.		4/5/2008	Parque Roquette Pinto slum – City of Rio de Janeiro – State of Rio de Janeiro	0392078- 54.2008.8.19.00 01	District of Capital, Notary of the 2nd Criminal Court.	disappeared on April 5, 2008. Nine days later his body was found in another municipality. The body was decomposing and without the head. At the Institute of Forensic Medicine, he was identified by a keychain we was wearing. The DNA test to Confirm his identity took a year to complete. It is believed was killed by members of a militia which remains active in the area in which persons associated with continue to reside. The militia have threatened persons associated with since his death. A number of other killings have occurred in the neighbourhood. However, they are often not reported due to fear of reprisals.	The investigation was closed for lack of evidence. In 2018, the State Public Defender's Office, opened a new process to find out the reason for the reduced number of investigations procedures by the civil police inspectors responsible for the investigation of the case.
50.	Pablo	11/08/2019	Complex of	031-06839 /	Public Security	Pablo Henrique was killed close to his home,	No one has been
	Henrique da		Chapadão	2019- 01	Specialized	around midnight, while he was returning from	punished for the crime.
	Silva Rangel		slum – City of Rio de		Action Group (GAESP) of	work. Policemen were seen shooting at him. After the shooting, the policemen approached him and	
			Janeiro –		Public	realized that they had hit a "worker". They put	

							safety to victims executed by the State. The Court of Justice denied the action on the grounds that the right to action has lapsed.
52.		06/24/2020; Minor at the time of the execution.	Tiradentes – City of São Paulo – State of São Paulo	Still in the establishment phase	53rd Police Station	, 16, was killed with five gun shots. The police reported that they discovered the body and that had participated in the robbery of a motorbike. The police did not identify the victim of the alleged theft, the motorbike or a weapon. It is believed that the killing was linked to the security services. Two other young men were reportedly killed in the same way (see cases 20 and 21).	Investigation underway.
53.	Paulo Roberto Pinho Menezes	10/17/2013	Manguinhos – City of Rio de Janeiro – State of Rio de Janeiro	Not informed	Not informed	Paulo was taken by policemen to an alley in the Manguinhos slum, where he was beaten and reportedly was suffocated to death.	Not informed.
54.	Pedro Henrique Nunes de Morais	07/03/2016	City of Taipas – State of São Paulo	Not informed	Not informed	Pedro was shot by a federal policeman. The police alleged that there was an exchange of fire when Pedro attempted to steal a police motorbike and that they responded in self-defence. However, Pedro was hit with 4 shots in the back and 2 shots in his chest and no policemen were injured.	Not informed.

						Additionally, Pedro appears to have been shot at close range. No information is available on any investigation undertaken into this allegation.	
55.	Pedro Nascort Filho	06/20/1999	City of Vitória – State of Espírito Santo	0019330- 87.2015.8.08.00 24	Espírito Santo State Court of Justice	Pedro worked as a car washer and had gone out to buy cigarettes. As he was walking along one of the main streets of the city, a car stopped near him. A group of officers fired 19 shots at him from the car. There were witnesses.	Three police officers were accused. One, PM was tried and sentenced to 18 years in prison. He was expelled from the police force. Another was acquitted for lack of evidence. The third was acquitted. The State was ordered to pay compensation, but did not comply with the sentence (case 0019330-87.2015.8.08.0024).
56.	Peterson Conti Senorelli	03/18/2015	Itaim Paulista District – City of São Paulo - State os São Paulo	0005369- 57.2016.8.26.00 52	Barra Funda Forum, 4th Jury Court	During a police perquisition, Peterson was beaten by military police, handcuffed and forcibly taken into a vehicle. About three hours later, he was left in the hospital with internal bleeding, head trauma, chest suffocation and later died because of the injuries.	Nobody was held responsible. After more than five years, there still has not been a hearing.
57.	Rafael Medina Paulino	12/05/2003	São João de Meriti – City of Rio	0022021- 97.2003.8.19.00 21	4th Criminal Court, District of Duque de	On the night of 5 December 2003, (13 years old), Rafael Paulino (18 years old) and two others went to a concert at the	8 police officers were reported in the criminal investigation phases.

58.		12/05/2003; Minor at the execution.	de Janeiro – State of Rio de Janeiro São João de Meriti – City of Rio de Janeiro – State of Rio de Janeiro		Caxias / RJ	nightclub "Via Show". They were last seen in the parking lot on 6 December 2003 around 4:40 a.m Their bodies were found on 9 December 2003, with signs of torture and rifle shots to the head. Investigations revealed that the four individuals were beaten by off duty military police officers, who worked as private security guards at the parking lot. The victims threatened with firearms and driven, in three vehicles, to an abandoned farm known as "Morambi", in the municipality of Duque de Caxias, where they were executed.	Two military police officers were sentenced to 68 years in prison for doubly qualified homicide and await trial on appeal and are on bail.
59.	Renan Henrique da Silva Lucena	11/11/2017	Lins of Vasconcelo s – City of Rio de Janeiro – State of Rio de Janeiro	Inquiry 90101693/2017	After a protest by family members, the Inquiry was transferred to the Public Security Specialized Action Group (GAESP) of Public Prosecutor's Office of Rio de Janeiro	Renan was walking in a square when he was approached by a military police officer. He raised his arms to show that he did not carry a gun. Nevertheless, the police officer shot him in the chest and head. Reportedly, there is video evidence showing police officers manipulating the crime scene, removing Renan's body from the scene and taking it to the vehicle. At the police station, the police presented a gun and drugs as belonging to Renan and accused him of resisting arrest.	No one was held responsible for the crime. The inquiry was stopped.
60.	Rodrigo do Carmo Tavares Raposo	10/17/2015	City of Nova Iguaçu – State of Rio de Janeiro	Inquiry 861-01429 / 2015	Public Prosecutor's Office - Rio de Janeiro	Rodrigo was talking to another individual when a black car suddenly appeared and stopped behind them. A man approached and asked if it was the Rodrigo who was stealing in the neighborhood. Rodrigo denied being involved, but the man pulled out a gun and fired shots at Rodrigo. He tried to	Investigation not concluded.

						run but was hit in the back and fell. The man approached and fired more shots. Reportedly, a week prior to the killing, Rodrigo had been threatened by a military police officer living on the same street involved in the militia who wanted R\$ 500 a week. Rodrigo was a soldier in the army and received R\$ 649, so he was unable to contribute this amount.	
61.	Carlos Eduardo dos Santos Santo	01/25/2019	Manguinhos – City of Rio de Janeiro – State of Rio de Janeiro	Not informed	Not informed	Carlos Eduardo, 27, was shot in the stomach by a sniper who is believed to have been a member of the city police. The incident occurred four days before the death of Rômulo Oliveira Silva (case below), in similar circumstances.	Not informed.
62.	Rômulo Oliveira da Silva	01/29/2019	Manguinhos – City of Rio de Janeiro – State of Rio de Janeiro	Not informed	Not informed	Rômulo, 37, was a porter at the Oswaldo Cruz Foundation (Fiocruz). He was taking his motorbike for repair on his day off. As he was returning from the mechanic's, he was shot in the chest by a sniper who was likely a member of the city Police. He was taken to an emergency medical service but did not survive. Carlos Eduardo dos Santos (case above), was killed in similar circumstances four days prior.	An investigation was launched. No information was found on the continuation of the investigations.
63.	Thiago da Costa Correia da Silva	04/16/2003	Morro do Borel slum – City of Rio de Janeiro – Estate of Rio de Janeiro	0142181- 17.2003.8.19.00 01	2nd Criminal Court	Thiago da Costa Correia da Silva, 19, was killed along with three others during the operation of the 6th Battalion of the Military Police, in the Borel hill. The four young men were hit in the head, chest, arm and forearm. The autopsy report attested to a "high kinetic energy" at the exit of the projectiles and some shots fired at "pointblank range". The police registered the deaths as	The case was closed on 25 November 2019. Nobody was held responsible.

64.	Thiago Henrique Moura Soares	10/27/2016	Federal District of Brazil	IPL(Civil Police Inquiry) nº 472/2016. Processo nº 0034952-74.201 6.8.07.0001	resulting from the self-defense of the police officers. However, investigations concluded that the four individuals were killed in an ambush. On 12 October 2016, Thiago was approached by military police near block 712 south, in Brasilia and taken to the 1st Civil Police Station. The same evening he was admitted to the Intensive Care Unit of the Hospital de Base do Distrito Federal in a critical condition. He had head trauma, kidney failure and other injuries. He died in hospital on 27 October 2016. Police officers claimed that Thiago injured himself. However the severity of his head injuries makes this unlikely. Videos taken by the police, published in the media, show Thiago in the police station lying on the floor, panting and immobilized	An investigation was opened only after family members submitted a police report. The case was the subject of police inquiry No. 472/2016. It was archived due to lack of evidence. The hypothesis of abuse by the police was not considered in the investigation. The members of the
					by several agents, one of whom kept a knee on his neck. Thiago was only taken to hospital after a relative arrived at the police station and noticed he was convulsing.	military police that approached Thialgo and were involved in his detention were never identified or heard, nor were the medical professionals that treated him asked for information. Persons associated with Thialgo faced difficulties in obtaining relevant records. They

	had to file a writ of
	mandamus in order to
	obtain his medical
	records and the Federal
	District stated that it
	was unable to produce
	medical imaging from
	examinations despite
	the Hospital's legal
	duty to store patient's
	full medical records.
	l l
	Four letters were sent
	requesting information
	on the progress of the
	case in 2016 to
	different bodies. No
	reply was received
	from the PGJDF or the
	Instituto Médico Legal
	IML-DF. One reply
	was received from the
	SSP/DF indicating that
	IPM
	2016.001.0083.0338
	was established to
	investigate the conduct
	of two individuals, for
	the crime of alleged
	bodily injury. No reply
	was received to a

65.	Thiago Santos da	03/04/2009	Carobinha Slum – City	Inquiry became a criminal action	35th Civil Police Station /	Thiago, 19, was heading to a party in Santa Cruz, when a group of police officers approached him	follow up letter requesting information on the progress of the case. No one was held responsible for the
	Hora Bento		of Rio de Janeiro – State of Rio de Janeiro		RJ	and asked him for money. Thiago had no money with him, so he was handed over by the police officers to the militia groups in Campo Grande and was reportedly executed. Thiago was killed with 2 rifle shots in the chest, on the left side. The police station contacted his family four years later.	crime.
66.	Uanderson Novaes Ventura	12/04/2019	City of Brumado – State of Bahia	1468/19	Not informed	Uanderson was killed by the police. His killing occurred near the Center for Integral Attention to Children and Adolescents - CAIC, a public school. Reportedly, Uanderson begging for his life and he claimed to be innocent prior to the killing. The police still shot him several times, without giving him time to explain. The police claimed the victim had shot first, but reportedly Uanderson was unarmed. There were witnesses. Reportedly, in 2020 police threatened persons associated with Uanderson and insulted family	The case is the subject of police inquiry No. 83/2019 at Brumado Police Station.
67.	Victor Hugo de Jesus Pires	06/17/2018	City of São João de Meriti – State of Rio de Janeiro	Inquiry No. 861/00851/2018	Public Security Specialized Action Group (GAESP) of Public Prosecutor's	members. Victor Hugo de Jesus Pires and Vitor Oliveira de Souza were riding a motorbike when a police vehicle crashed into them, causing them both to fall. After the vehicle collided, the policemen exited the vehicle and immediately began firing. A crowd of residents who had witnessed the incident	Nobody was held responsible. Witnesses are being heard.

68.	Vitor Oliveira de Souza	06/17/2018	City of São João de Meriti – State of Rio de Janeiro	Inquiry No. 861/00851/2018	Office of Rio de Janeiro Public Security Specialized Action Group (GAESP) of Public Prosecutor's	and knew the two individuals then rioted to protest against the incident.	
					Office of Rio de Janeiro		
69.		4/12/2020; Minor at the time of the execution.	Barro Vermelho, Gramacho, Duque de Caxias, Rio de Janeiro state	Not informed	Not informed	On 4 December 2020, 4, and 7, were playing outside their house in the Barro Vermelho community in Gramacho, a neighbourhood in Duque de Caxias, Rio de Janeiro state, as they were shot. and in the chest.	Not informed.
70.		4/12/2020; Minor at the time of the execution.	Barro Vermelho, Gramacho, Duque de Caxias, Rio de Janeiro state			Reportedly, military police officers were seeking to approach two people on a motorbike and there were at least three shots. Military police officials later issued a statement that there were no shots fired by police. However, reportedly, there was no crossfire, only gunshots attributed to police officers.	
71.	Jhordan Luiz Natividade	December 2020	Belford Roxo, state of Rio de Janeiro	Not informed	Not informed	Jhordan Luiz Natividade, 17, and Edson Arguinez Júnior, 20, were shot at point-blank range on their motorbikes during a police approach. Security camera footage shows a police car parked during a raid, in an area where there is little visibility for	Not informed.

72.	Edson Arguinez Júnior	December 2020	Belford Roxo, state of Rio de Janeiro	motorists. One policeman is seen standing in the middle of the road, while another talks to the driver of a vehicle near the curb. When the motorbike passes in the street, the driver slows down and dodges the officer, who shoots at close range. Edson, who was driving the motorbike, lost his balance and fell.
				The two were detained and were alive when they got into a police car at 1:15am. Jhordan was also handcuffed, although it can be seen from the video that there was no justification for this. Edson appears in the recorded images with his shirt over the spot where he was shot to stop the bleeding and has a head-wound.
				The following afternoon, less than three kilometers from the scene of the shooting, the bodies of Jhordan and Edson were found, showing signs of torture, including bone fractures and firearm injuries.