(Translated from Russian)

Additional information and comments by the Republic of Uzbekistan on the communication from the Special Rapporteur in the field of cultural rights, Karima Bennoune, and the Special Rapporteur on adequate housing as a component of the right to an adequate standard of living, and on the right to non-discrimination in this context, Leilani Farha

1. Comments on the assertions of the Special Rapporteurs

1. The human right to adequate housing is crucial to the enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights. The “Well-Maintained Village” and “Well-Maintained Mahalla” programmes (“Obod kishloq” and “Obod mahalla” programmes) are aimed at gradually improving the living conditions of the population and introducing positive changes to the way of life and standard of living, with a view to boosting the profile of villages and the local bodies known as mahallas and creating jobs. There are plans to build or improve 312,549 residential buildings with more than 1.6 million inhabitants within the framework of State programmes. Considerable work is being done to provide provincial and district centres with amenities and bring about urban renewal.

2. However, the complaints and communications received from residents indicate that there are problems with creating and improving the housing and living conditions of the population. For example, owing to the irresponsibility of local chief administrators (hokim), housing stock has not been repaired for years, which has led to the deterioration of the roofing of houses and facades that no longer meet established requirements. Furthermore, there are frequent power grid and transformer accidents and shortages of liquified petroleum gas in communities. Another pressing problem is the poor quality of road repair and maintenance work at the local level, water supply facilities and networks in a state of disrepair and sewage systems that do not meet sanitation requirements.

3. During large-scale construction and reconstruction work on the housing stock, owners of houses, apartments and other real estate rightly complain about local authorities and developers who act in violation of the law when demolishing housing without notice or public discussion.

4. The Tashkent chief administration and investors carried out demolitions of individual low-rise residential and office buildings in different parts of the city in connection with the reconstruction, further urban development and improvements to road and transport infrastructure in Tashkent in the period 2016–2019.

5. The number of dwelling houses that have been affected in the areas where demolitions occurred under decisions of the Government of Uzbekistan and decisions of the chief administrator of Tashkent was approximately 2,000, in which more than 4,700 families were living (without taking into account those formally registered but not living at the address in the residence permit, who sometimes make up as much as 40 to 50 per cent of the total number of permanent residents).

6. With respect to projects for the demolition of the House of the Train Driver cultural heritage site, located at 45 Amir Temur Street in the Mirabad district, by decision of the Tashkent chief administrator (No. 103 of 19 January 2018), the private enterprise Memon Mekanizatsiya Qurilish was given a permit to carry out demolition work on residential and non-residential buildings and make land improvements in Mirabad district from Said Baraka Street to Moshtabit Street and along Avenue Amir Temur. The Ministry of Culture of Uzbekistan has recognized the house at 45 Amir Temur Street as a cultural heritage site and demolition work on the house has now stopped.

7. By order of the Ministry on 28 June 2019, the Department of Cultural Heritage has been entrusted with the task of involving scholars, experts and qualified specialists in the
collection of information on the building and its historical and cultural value and in research and other necessary activities.

8. According to the chief administration of Samarkand province, there have never been any plans to demolish any dwellings on Khodja Akhmar Street. The descriptions provided in the joint communication of the Special Rapporteurs suggest that they are in fact referring to Namozgah Street. However, to date, not a single house has been demolished, nor are there any plans to do so in the near future.

9. A review of the problems with the demolition of dwellings and resettlement of citizens has shown that it is not permanent residents but rather permanently registered citizens also wishing to receive housing in compensation for demolitions who are the main source of discontent and complaints.

10. Given the dwelling unit density of 3–3.5 families per residential building, the amount of compensation provided in the form of apartments or plots of land was often higher than the market value of the demolished dwelling.

11. In this regard, the provision of housing to registered citizens, as opposed to residents, is examined by commissions of the offices of the regional chief administrators, taking into account the place of actual residence, ownership of a second home, average household income, etc.

12. In addition, previously, a large share of the complaints were from people whose homes were located in areas that had been allocated to business entities for construction provided the costs of the demolition work and resettlement were borne by the investor.

13. There has been virtually no monitoring of the demolition work, provision of compensation or holding of dialogues between the population and the regional chief administrators in such areas. All negotiations with the public, provision of housing and other activities are carried out by business entities on their own, with practically no monitoring on the part of the authorities.

14. However, pursuant to Presidential Decree No. UP-5511 of 15 August 2018, on measures to carry out the pilot project to improve the investment climate in Tashkent, a new procedure for granting land to business entities and authorizing the demolition of residential buildings has been introduced that envisages tentatively setting aside plots of land for business entities for a certain period, during which the enterprises take steps to compensate and resettle citizens; only after this is done may the land, free of buildings, be provided to the business for urban planning activities.

2. Measures and action taken by the authorities to avoid resettlement and the demolition of houses

15. Pursuant to Presidential Decree No. UP-5490 of 27 July 2018, on measures to further improve the system of protection of the rights and legitimate interests of business entities, a central fund has been established under the Cabinet of Ministers to compensate citizens and business entities for the seizure of their land for State and social needs and the agreement of the fund is now required for the seizure of land for State and social needs.

16. Presidential Order No. R-5491 of 3 August 2019, on additional measures to fully guarantee the property rights of citizens and business entities, established a procedure for the seizure of land and the demolition of real estate of citizens and business entities to be carried out in three stages.

17. In the first stage, a set of documents on the area in which the demolitions are planned is submitted by the regional chief administrator to the Cabinet of Ministers. The Government then comes up with findings in accordance with urban planning requirements and financial estimates. The findings are then submitted to the Prime Minister for consideration and action.

18. The documents are approved by the members of the national coordination working group and regional working groups set up to take stock of the extent of the loss incurred by citizens and business entities in the event of seizure of land.

19. The national working group has been assigned the following tasks:
• Taking stock of the loss incurred by local citizens and business entities and determining its actual extent on the basis of fair market value

• Offering remedies and, if the harm caused is the result of an unlawful decision by an official, recovering the losses from these officials by seeking legal recourse

• Coming up with specific proposals for improving legislation and holding officials to account for wrongdoing

20. The Chairs of the Council of Ministers of the Republic of Qoraqalpog’iston and provincial, district and city chief administrators are personally responsible for full compliance with the law as regards the seizure of land, including:

• Informing owners in due course according to the established procedure about decisions taken to seize land and demolish residential and non-residential buildings or other constructions, structures or plantings located on the plots of land

• Preventing the demolition of houses and other buildings and structures on seized land before preliminary and full compensation is provided for the loss at market value

• Making available temporary housing, according to the established procedure during the development of the land, provided as compensation to resettled citizens for up to two years

21. In addition, the Cabinet of Ministers has been requested to take a decision that covers:

• Implementing government programmes and major investment and other projects with due account taken of the view of the majority of the region’s population

• Selecting the plots of land to be seized, primarily those with dilapidated or condemned buildings, including unused buildings, involving public discussions with the owners of real estate located on them

• Obtaining the consent of owners of residential and non-residential properties located in a given area and entering into written agreements on compensation for losses so that chief administrators may make decisions on the seizure of land

22. Pursuant to the above-mentioned presidential order, the Ministry of Justice has prepared a bill to amend certain pieces of legislation; the Government has also drafted a decision on further measures to guarantee the property rights of persons and entities and to improve the procedure for the seizure of land plots and the provision of compensation in connection with such seizures and a decision on measures to ensure greater availability of land for business and urban planning activities.

23. The experience of Belarus, Ukraine, Kazakhstan, the Russian Federation and others was drawn on in the drafting of the relevant laws and regulations.

24. The bills have been posted on the common interactive public services portal of Uzbekistan for public discussion. They have then been further developed based on the comments and proposals put forward, and submitted to the Cabinet of Ministers.

3. Please inform us about any efforts carried out by the authorities to ensure that the planned urban regeneration projects in Samarkand and Tashkent are in compliance with the rights of the affected residents to be consulted and to participate in decision-making. Please also explain the extent to which the rights of the affected residents to housing and to participate in cultural life have been considered.

4. Please indicate if any resettlement programmes have been considered or implemented in consultation with those affected, how many people will benefit from these resettlement programmes in Samarkand, Tashkent and other cities, and whether all affected residents and tenants can return to their respective neighbourhoods after implementation of the regeneration programmes.
5. Please indicate if any adequate compensation for the loss of home and property has been put in place for affected homeowners and tenants living in the urban regeneration areas and their adequacy in comparison to the value of the homes and land. Please provide more information on short and long-term accommodation that has or will be provided for the affected residents of Tashkent and other cities, including their adequacy, affordability and location.

6. Please provide information concerning measures taken to ensure that none of the residents, tenants or inhabitants of the affected urban regeneration areas will become homeless as a consequence of the planned demolition of houses.

25. The organization of demolition work and the resettlement of citizens in Tashkent and compensation for losses in connection with the seizure of land for State and social needs is carried out according to Cabinet of Ministers decision No. 97 of 29 May 2006 and has been entrusted to the Commission of the District Administrations of Tashkent headed by the regional chief administrators or their deputies.

26. The resettlement of families or individual citizens from the demolition zones is carried out in accordance with the regulations approved by the above-mentioned decision of the Cabinet of Ministers, i.e. by:

• Providing citizens with title to equivalent well-appointed housing with a floor space not less than the standard floor space per inhabitant and covering the cost of plantings
• Giving payments to citizens for the market value of the demolished dwelling houses and other buildings, structures and plantings and compensation for the losses incurred by the owners in connection with the seizure of land
• Allotting plots of land to citizens for private housing construction within the established standards and providing them with temporary rented accommodation while the land is being developed, for up to two years, along with compensation in full for the market value of the demolished houses or apartments, buildings, structures and plantings and for the losses incurred by owners in connection with the seizure of land
• Paying full compensation for the losses incurred by the seizure of land, for State and social needs
• Relocating and rebuilding dwelling houses, buildings and structures belonging to citizens and entities and also compensating for the losses incurred by owners in connection with the seizure of land
• Constructing dwelling houses and buildings and transferring ownership to citizens and entities and compensating owners for losses incurred in connection with the seizure of land

27. The demolition of homes and resettlement of citizens from the demolition zone are carried out only with the consent of the citizens to resettlement or by allocating to them if they so desire plots of land for private housing construction.

28. The following work has been done by way of compensation for the resettlement of citizens.

A total of 1,426 families living in Ukchi and Olmazar mahallas in the Shaykhontohur district of Tashkent were evicted from the construction area of Tashkent City international business centre and allocated apartments, as follows:

• 1,070 families were resettled in 21 multistorey apartment buildings in the Yashnobod district
• 110 families in 3 new multistorey apartment buildings on Churkursai Street in Olmazar district
• 31 families in a new multistorey apartment building on Kamarniso Olmazar Street
• 21 families in a new multistorey apartment building in the Samarkand Darboza mahalla in the Shaykhontohur district
• 159 families were provided with apartments from the secondary housing market
• 35 families were allocated plots of land to build private houses

29. Citizens were resettled only after the residential buildings had been up and running and the apartments in them were provided to the resettled citizens only with their agreement.

30. Furthermore, the development of extensive multistorey buildings and the resettlement of citizens were undertaken in accordance with their wishes to live together with their neighbours away from the demolition zones.

31. During the construction period, citizens were provided with cash for rent at their request in various districts of Tashkent amounting to the equivalent of US$ 175 to US$ 200 per month.

32. Compensation is primarily provided to permanently resident families, and the provision of compensation to registered families who are not residents is awarded to them at the discretion of the commission attached to the office of the district chief administrator.

33. With a view to helping citizens living in the Ukchi and Olmazar mahallas of Shaiikhsukhlu district feel at ease, the Council of People's Deputies (Kengush) of Tashkent has taken the decision to change the name of the Marifat mahalla, where 21 apartments were built, to Ukchi and Olmazar.

34. Free plots of land in Tashkent and the suburbs in Tashkent province for the construction of private dwelling houses were exchanged for apartments from the secondary housing market by offering persons who so desired land in exchange of their apartments, which were transferred to the regional chief administration and then distributed among the residents based on their choice.

35. In accordance with paragraph 14 of the above-mentioned regulations compensation is provided to permanently resident citizens and members of their families.

36. The procedure for granting plots of land to business entities and demolition of housing was also changed, with plots of land being tentatively set aside for business entities for a certain period, during which the entity takes steps involving compensation and the resettlement of citizens; only after this is done may the land, free of buildings, be provided to the business for urban planning activities.

37. In accordance with Presidential Decree No. UP-5490 of 27 July 2018, on measures to further improve the system of protection of the rights and legitimate interests of business entities, decisions to seize plots of land for State and social needs may be taken only after a public discussion with the parties whose land is subject to seizure is held and a cost-benefit analysis carried out. Residential and commercial buildings and other buildings and structures belonging to citizens and business entities may be demolished in the event of seizure of land only after full compensation for the market value of the real estate and losses incurred by the owners in connection with such seizures is paid.

7. Please indicate what procedures you have in place to ensure adequate notice is provided prior to any forced eviction and the availability of legal aid to assist residents should they wish to challenge the decisions.

38. Under Presidential Order No. R-5491 of 3 August 2019 on additional measures to fully guarantee the property rights of citizens and business entities, the Chairs of the Council of Ministers of the Republic of Qoraqalpog'iston and provincial, district and city chief administrators are personally responsible for full compliance with the law in the event of seizure of land, in particular informing owners in due course according to the established procedure about decisions taken to seize land and demolish residential and business buildings or other constructions, structures or plantings located on plots of land.

39. The Cabinet of Ministers is currently preparing a decision that provides for:
• Implementation of government programmes and major investment and other projects with due account taken of the view of the majority of the region’s population
• Selection of plots of land to be seized, primarily those with dilapidated or condemned buildings, including unused buildings, involving public discussions with the owners of real estate located on them

• Obtaining the consent of owners of residential and non-residential properties located in a given area and entering into written agreements on compensation for losses so that chief administrators may make decisions on the seizure of land

8. Please indicate what administrative or judicial mechanisms are in place, both at national and municipal levels, to ensure access to remedies and accountability of various actors so that individuals and groups can claim their right to adequate housing and to participate in cultural life. Please provide us as well with information about the number of judicial and non-judicial complaints made by affected residents and their respective outcomes.

9. Please explain the reasons for the destruction of areas of historical and cultural significance in Samarkand, and their compatibility with the human rights standards mentioned above.

40. The country has established a system of legal protection of rights, which brings together the work of economic, administrative and civil courts that handle disputes at the regional level to ensure access to remedies and accountability on the part of the various actors so that individual persons and groups may assert their right to adequate housing.

41. The service attached to the Office of the President responsible for defending the rights of citizens and monitoring and coordinating the processing of communications has conducted an analysis of the complaints about the demolition of dwelling houses in Uzbekistan and seizures for state and social needs along with complaints received through online and public help desks attached to the Office, including communications from Tashkent, Samarkand and Yangiyul. As a result of the analysis, measures are being taken to resolve the systemic problems found and hold officials accountable.

42. In particular, since 1 November 2018, the online and public help desks attached to the Office of the President have received 236 complaints from Tashkent residents, 26 from Samarkand and 16 from Yangiyul.

43. In order to protect the rights of homeowners, the Ministry of Justice has taken action on the applications from them on violations of their homeownership rights; in that connection, it has examined the issue of receiving compensation under the established procedures for the seizure of land for state and social needs.

44. According to the Ministry, the highest number of such applications came from Tashkent, Tashkent province and Namangan province and the lowest from Navoiy province.

45. The Ministry has drawn up a cadastral certificate of plots of land seized for state and social needs for 2018 and the first half of 2019 and also of properties that have been demolished.

46. It was found that, in 846 such cases, the owners had not been notified about the imminent demolition under the established procedure; in 1,388, there had been a violation of the time frame for notification; and most of the property had been demolished without a prior assessment of its market value. The greatest number of such cases were in Tashkent and Buxoro province and the smallest in Samarkand province.

47. The amount of compensation paid out during the demolition process was more than 600 billion som. Furthermore, a monitoring exercise found arrears of more than 300 billion sum in payments in compensation for demolished residential and non-residential buildings in the city of Tashkent and Tashkent, Farg`ona, Qashqadaryo and Namangan provinces.

48. In exchange for the plots of land seized for state and social needs, 359.2 ha of land have been allocated to the owners of the demolished property.

49. As part of the actions taken, 874 cases of violations of the law were found. The justice authorities made 236 submissions requesting the payment of monetary compensation to
natural persons and legal entities amounting to more than 6.5 billion sum, issued 100
warnings and brought 360 statements of claim, totalling 30.3 billion sum before the courts.

50. A list of tangible heritage sites was approved in accordance with the order of the
Ministry of Culture of 28 June 2019.

51. Among the residential buildings on this list were the dwelling houses of residents who
had applied to the Ministry of Culture to have their homes included in the national cadastre
of cultural heritage sites.

52. Five dwelling houses in Tashkent were duly included in the national register in the
light of the definition of historical and cultural heritage.

53. The procuratorial authorities regularly checks to ensure that the rights of natural
persons and legal entities are observed during demolitions. When evidence of violations
comes to light, appropriate measures are taken with respect to the offender in accordance
with the law.

Tashkent

54. As for Tashkent, in particular the article published on the news website Gazeta.uz
entitled "House No. 78 is still being demolished even though people are living in it", which
reported that the three-storey 18-unit apartment building on 78 Ankhor Buyi Street in the
Shaikhontokhursk district was demolished on the basis of a decision of the chief
administrator of Tashkent, No. 1204 of 8 September 2017, in connection with the
construction of the Navrus amusement park on 17 ha of land.

55. According to the report of the meeting of the Cabinet of Ministers at its special session,
No. 5 of 73 October 2018, it was planned that the tenants of this building would be resettled
before 20 November 2018 and the building would be completely demolished by 10 December
2018.

56. However, during an inspection it was established that the demolition work was being
carried out without providing E. Nishanbaev (apt. 2), K. Kholmatova (apt. 4) and L.
Shkodskikh (apt. 7) any other equivalent living quarters to move into from the demolished
house.

57. In this connection, on 25 February 2019, the office of the procurator of Tashkent
brought disciplinary charges against O. Musaev, the head of the department of the Centre for
the Management of Municipal Assets of Tashkent responsible for resettling the residents of
this house. Mr. Musaev was reprimanded by order of the Director General of the Centre on
28 February 2019.

Samarkand province

58. The procuratorial authorities carried out an on-site visit and spoke with the residents
of this province during its review of the issues referred to in the communication of the Special
Rapporteur.

59. It was established that there was no decision on the part of the chief administrator of
Samarkand for the demolition of 500 houses in the district (mahalla) of Khodja Akhrar, nor
was any such decision issued. Therefore, 600 inhabitants living in this district could not have
been left out on the street and there was no deadline for the eviction of citizens from their
homes set by the official authorities.

60. Decision No. 2093-k of the chief administrator of Samarkand of 1 November 2018
provides for the reconstruction of roads and the surrounding area in order to improve the
city’s appearance and to follow current trends for streets such as Giyosiddin Zhamsidh, Ibn
Sinio, Butansoroi, Amir Temur, Khusain Baikaro, Ulug Tursunov, B. Mashrab, Mukuny and,
in the Khodja Akhrar Vali mahalla, such streets as Mukuny, Orif Gulkhany, Samaria, N.
Devonbegi, Khondamir, Khodja Akhrar Vali and Namozgokh.
Tashkent province

61. The procuratorial authorities have also reviewed the allegations put forward in the joint communication of the Special Rapporteurs concerning the violation of the rights of the inhabitants of the demolished residential buildings in the town of Yangiyul.

62. With a view to improving the town of Yangiyul in connection with the above-mentioned commissions, on 26 June 2019, the regional chief administrator took the decision to authorize planning for the construction of five-storey dwelling houses, Nos. 712 and 713, following the demolition of 1961 two-storey residential buildings, Nos. 103 and 105.

63. It has been established that buildings Nos. 103 and 105 are completely demolished and construction work is being done on the site by OOO Kishloq Kurilish Invest, a limited liability company. The residents of the above-mentioned residential buildings entered into agreements for compensation for the loss incurred under regulations approved by Cabinet of Ministers in its Decision No. 97 of 29 May 2006.

64. In addition, by decision of the town’s chief administration, there were plans to construct five-storey residential buildings to replace buildings Nos. 113, 115, 117, 119, 123, 127, 129, 131, 133, 135, 137 and 139. The demolition of buildings Nos. 113, 115, 117, 119, 123, 127, 129, 131, 133, 135, 137 and 139 was since suspended and then cancelled by decision of the Yangiyul chief administrator on 2 August 2019.

65. Prior to the adoption of Presidential Order No. F-5491 of 3 August 2019 on additional measures for unconditional guarantees of citizens’ and business entities’ property rights, the necessary steps were taken in the province to compensate citizens and business entities for losses incurred as a result of the seizure of land for State and social needs: 10,594 citizens were given compensation amounting to 114 trillion sum and 953 legal entities 21.6 trillion sum.

66. Despite the measures taken to prevent negative consequences from occurring during the implementation of the above-mentioned actions, there were still cases in which property was unlawfully demolished.

67. In order to implement the decision of the chief administrator of Qashadaryo province, No. K-942/09 of 12 September 2018, on measures for the construction, repair and improvement of the village of Eski Yakcabog in Yakcabog district, a road map was developed to address the problems that arose and to further improve the region.

68. It should be noted that, on 20 July 2019, the deputy chief administrator of Yakcabog district, Mansur Tuimaev, conducted a communication campaign among owners of shops located along Okhnyababaev Street on the demolition of buildings along the street that projected beyond the building line. In the course of the demolition work on the shop belonging to [redacted], an employee of the limited liability company, [redacted], who introduced himself at the time of the incident as the head of the company, [redacted], put up resistance, doused Mr. Tuimaev with petrol, who had taken the seat of the excavator driver, [redacted], and set the deputy chief administrator on fire. On 20 July, the Qashadaryo province procurator’s office brought a criminal case against [redacted] for offences covered under articles 25 (1) and 97 of the Criminal Code. In the course of the investigation, [redacted] acts were reclassified as offences under articles 25 and 98 of the Code, and the deputy chief administrator, Mr. Tuimaev was accused of committing offences under articles 192-1 (3) (a) and 206 (2) (a). In addition, during the investigation, citizens and business owners were given compensation for losses amounting to 692.7 million sum.

69. Plans have now been made at three citizens meetings of mahallas held in Eski Yakcabog – Eski Yakcabog, Mustakiliq and Ibn Sino – to carry out repairs and home improvements of 1,801 dwelling houses; work has begun on 1,510 of them and facade works on 1,250 have been completed. There are also plans for a major overhaul of a 2.5 km section of the 30 m wide Yakcabog-Chirakchi-Shurbazar Road (4R84). In this connection, 34 residential and 71 non-residential buildings were demolished along the section of the road under repair.
70. In accordance with the requirements of the regulations approved by Decision No. 97 of 26 May 2006 of the Cabinet of Ministers in connection with the seizure of land plots for State and social needs, 0.04 ha of land each were allocated for private housing construction.

71. Furthermore, owners of partially demolished homes were provided with compensation amounting to 692.8 million sum and new walls and facades were put up to replace the demolished walls of 20 houses at the expense of construction companies.

72. It is worth noting that, to date, 98 per cent of the planned construction work on 2.5 km of pavement has been completed. 98 lamp posts have been installed and the section of Yakkabog-Chirakchi-Shurbazar Road has been repaved and landscaped.

73. In view of the above, every necessary measure is being taken by the local authorities and other competent bodies to prevent the unlawful destruction of historical monuments and the demolition of private homes and to provide timely and adequate compensation and temporary accommodation or land plots for the construction of new buildings.

74. According to the statistical report of the Supreme Court of Uzbekistan, for the first nine months of 2019, the civil courts handled 260 claims for compensation for the cost of dwelling houses and other buildings totalling 29,872,978,926 sum in connection with the seizure of plots of land for State and social needs and 72 cases involving the demolition of dwelling houses and other buildings in connection with the seizure of plots of land, on which they were located, for State and social needs (see annex 1).

75. Of the total number of cases involving claims for compensation considered by the courts, 179 resulted in judgments being issued, with 165 claims being met, totalling 22,964,551,948 sum; 14 such cases were dismissed; proceedings were dropped in 5 civil cases; and 76 cases were not considered.

76. Of the 72 cases involving claims over demolitions examined in the first nine months in 2019, 48 resulted in judgments being issued, with the claims being settled in 40 cases and dismissed in 8 cases and proceedings dropped in 7; 17 cases were not considered (see annex 2).

10. Please provide information about the existing plans for the preservation of UNESCO World Heritage sites, that constitute the common heritage of all humankind, and that would be affected by the demolition.

77. As part of the implementation of the recommendations put forward at the forty-third session of the UNESCO World Heritage Committee on the property, Samarkand – Crossroad of Cultures, the President of Uzbekistan took the decision to impose a moratorium on all kinds of construction work in the historic area and buffer zone of Samarkand until the potential effect of such work is fully assessed and appropriate measures are taken to protect the outstanding world heritage site. The Government is working with experts from the International Council on Monuments and Sites to develop a management plan for the historic area of Samarkand.

78. According to the report of the Cabinet of Ministers, No. 01-05/1-856 of 11 September 2018, on the implementation of measures to accelerate the development of tourism in Samarkand, any construction in the historic area is prohibited.

11. We urge that all necessary interim measures be taken to halt the alleged violations and prevent their recurrence and, in the event that the investigations support or suggest the allegations to be correct, to ensure the accountability of any person responsible for the alleged violations.

79. Pursuant to Presidential Decree No. UP-5577 of 14 November 2018 on additional measures to improve State regulation in the area of construction, the Ministry of Construction has drafted a new version of the Town Planning Code of Uzbekistan, which provides for specific procedures for organizing public debates (including the objectives, time frames, stages, forms, recording and publication of the outcomes of the debates) and detailed regulation of public assessments conducted by the local authorities with the participation of citizens in addressing issues arising from the use of plots of land that affects their interests. The draft code is currently undergoing a domestic interdepartmental approval procedure.
80. Furthermore, a master plan for the city of Tashkent is currently being developed and a new master plan for the city of Samarkand is at the finalization and approval stage.
Annex 1

Statistics on cases heard involving claims for compensation of the cost of dwelling houses and other buildings in connection with the seizure of plots of land for State and social needs for the first nine months of 2019

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Province</th>
<th>No. of cases</th>
<th>Amount</th>
<th>Judgments issued</th>
<th>Settled No.</th>
<th>Amount</th>
<th>Dismissed</th>
<th>Case proceedings discontinued</th>
<th>Cases not considered</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Republic of Qoraqalpog’iston</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>218 201 083</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>215 201 083</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Andijon province</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>5 637 895 682</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>5 203 670 561</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Buxoro province</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>128 791 143.0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>128 791 143</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Jizzax province</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>156 620 000</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>156 620 000</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Qashqadaryo province</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>697 976 244</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>577 763 194</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Navoiy province</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1 030 727 135</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1 013 650 212</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Namangan province</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>950 760 225</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>695 123 255</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Samarkand province</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1 270 159 578</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1 270 159 578</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Surxondaryo province</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>786 307 731</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>708 736 787</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Sirdaryo province</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>1 923 939 260</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>1 182 380 109</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Farg’ona province</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1 182 969 549</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>1 163 998 651</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Xorazm province</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1 388 481 250</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>110 439 000</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>Tashkent province</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>8 826 458 149</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>7 105 824 949</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>Tashkent</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>5 673 691 897</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3 432 193 426</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total cases heard: 260
Total amount: 29 872 978 926
Settled amount: 179 165
Total cases not considered: 76
Annex 2

Statistics on cases heard involving the demolition of dwelling houses and other buildings in connection with the seizure of plots of land, on which they were located, for State and social needs for the first nine months of 2019

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Province</th>
<th>Total No. of cases heard</th>
<th>Judgments issued</th>
<th>Including Settled</th>
<th>Dismissed</th>
<th>Case proceedings discontinued</th>
<th>Cases not considered</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Republic of Qoraqalpog‘iston</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Andijon province</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Buxoro province</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Jizzax province</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Qashqadaryo province</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Naviyo province</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Namangan province</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Samarkand province</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Surxondaryo province</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Sirdaryo province</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Farg‘ona province</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Xorazm province</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Tashkent province</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Tashkent</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>72</strong></td>
<td><strong>48</strong></td>
<td><strong>40</strong></td>
<td><strong>8</strong></td>
<td><strong>7</strong></td>
<td><strong>17</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>